



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

Protocol of Publication
LIGS University

Program	INTERACTIVE ONLINE PhD
Specialization	MANAGEMENT
Given name and surname of the author	ATAKILT H. SIYUM
Co-authors	UMAR LAWAL ALIYU
Title of the paper / article	JOB MOTIVATION AND INCOME SATISFACTION AMONG GOVERNMENTAL AND PRIVATE HOSPITALS IN TIGRAY, ETHIOPIA
Medium	-----
Publication date	09 SEPTEMBER 2019
Approved by (supervisor's name)	UMAR LAWAL ALIYU
Turnitin check (Doctoral Supervisor will add this information)	Paper Originality: 81% Plagiarism: 19% Quoted: 0% Linked: 0%

Short annotation (approx. 100 words):

Health care services can be provided via Governmental and Nongovernmental providers. Private healthcare is more common and is used to describe medical services that are not covered by the government. Human resources management practices are essential for retaining effective professionals in Hospitals that are addressing health workforce challenges and developing the health workforce strategy of a country. The overall objective of this study is the Job motivation and income satisfaction among Governmental and Private Hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia. The findings of the research work shows that there were Job motivation and income satisfaction among Governmental and Private Hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia.

Keywords (minimum 6 - 8 words or phrases):

Governmental, Health care, Health Facility, Health Workers, Hospital, Human Resource, Income satisfaction, Job motivation, Management, Performance, Private, satisfaction

Research question:

Is there a difference in Job motivation and income satisfaction among governmental and private hospitals?

Text of the paper / article:



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

JOB MOTIVATION AND INCOME SATISFACTION AMONG GOVERNMENTAL AND PRIVATE HOSPITALS IN TIGRAY, ETHIOPIA

Name: Atakilt H. Siyum and Umar Lawal Aliyu

Date: September 2019



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

ABSTRACT

Health care services can be provided via Governmental and Nongovernmental providers. Private healthcare is more common and is used to describe medical services that are not covered by the government. Human resources management practices are essential for retaining effective professionals in Hospitals that are addressing health workforce challenges and developing the health workforce strategy of a country. The overall objective of this study is the Job motivation and income satisfaction among Governmental and Private Hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia.

A cross-sectional simple survey involving 379 human resource employees of the Governmental and Private Hospitals found in Tigray regional was carried out from January to March 2019. Participants from each private and governmental general and primary Hospital were selected using simple random sampling (SRS) and the survey was supplemented by structured questionnaire adopted from literature reviews. The collected data was entered into SPSS Software version 25.0 and was cleaned and analyzed. Descriptive analyses of variance and Binary logistic regression and Cross tabulation with Chi-Square was used. The results were summarized as crude and adjusted odds ratios at 95% confidence intervals. The findings show that there were Job motivation and income satisfaction among Governmental and Private Hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia.

Keywords: Governmental, Health care, Health Facility, Health Workers, Hospital, Human Resource, Income satisfaction, Job motivation, Management, Performance, Private, satisfaction.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background to the Study



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

Health care services can be provided via Governmental and Nongovernmental providers. Public health can be defined as the science of safeguarding the well-being and improving or restoring the health of communities by using the tools of education, policy-making and research for disease and injury prevention. Private healthcare is healthcare and medicine provided by entities other than the government. "Private healthcare" is more common and is used to describe medical services that are not possible to accomplish the government. Private health care can be given through "profit making hospitals, self-employed practitioners and not profit making non-government health providers". (FMOH, 2005).

Inspired health care workers are in the first place to achieve both domestic and international health goals. At the center of each health system, the work force is crucial to advancing health. There should be optimum number and professional mix of human resource for the effective treatment and worth of the intended services (Ozcan S, et.al, 1995). Health services are labor intensive and personal in nature. As funds become accessible from different initiatives like Global Fund against HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria, more obliged low income Countries Initiative and other processes, the ability to suck up them will be constrained without appropriate human resources (Martinez J, Martineau T, 1998).

The researcher would want to make assesement of the Job motivation and income satisfaction of workers to realize national and global health goals and understand those motives that can prompt health workers to put in their best at all times in both governmental and private Hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia

1.2 Statement of the Research Problem

Global economic depression has put major constraints on government budgets recently. The demand for covering health care expense for both private and public health care facilities from multiple funders are becoming increasing and this dependency might be by encouragement of International Monetary Fund (IMF), that countries increase the



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

scope of private sector provision in health care as part of loan conditions to reduce government debt. However, The complaints of the private health area thinks that public healthcare delivery is of most helpful to unfortunate people and is the single way to accomplish general and fair access to health care.

For example, an earlier analysis of health care providers sharing using facility data from three developing countries accredited that the shortage of a homogeneous occupational coding system to recognize provider type resulted in difficulties in conducting cross-national comparisons (Amin S, Das J, Goldstein M, 2008).

1.3 Research Question

- i. Is there a difference in Job motivation and income satisfaction among governmental and private hospitals?

1.4 Objective of the Study

- i. General objective: The general objective of this study is to assess Job motivation and income satisfaction among governmental and private hospitals in Tigray Region, Ethiopia.
- ii. Specific objectives: To identify the health provider's income satisfaction level and Job motivation between governmental and private Hospital

1.5 Significance of the Study

The significance of the studies is:

- i. The primary importance of the study is to assist the policy formulating bodies and decision makers to give due emphasis to HRM in both governmental and private sectors and devise different mechanisms in order to improve performance in private and governmental Hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

- ii. The study can be used to address problems and improve understanding in the practices of income satisfaction and Job motivation in public and private Hospitals
- iii. Finally, the research can be recommended for further study.

1.6 Scope and Limitation of the Study

This study is to assess Job motivation and income satisfaction among governmental and private Hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia by assessing 42 public and private Hospitals. The selection criteria of health facilities are labor homogeneous and financial aspects that have a wider scope than others do particularly the most important roles of Tigray health Bureau and to provide the necessary support on personnel matters for other health facilities, consistent with its proclamation. Since this bureau plays supporting role by conducting training, guidance and counseling concerning HR manual, issuing human resource management manual, handling complaints, updating and supervising the other sectors in performing the HRM functions, it was selected as the study area. The study uses cross-sectional simple survey therefore; data was collected from the sample respondents selected through simple random technique at the same time at one point in time.

A major limitation of this study is that the research is conducted using a sample population from some Hospitals. The purpose of this study is to compare the public and private Hospitals staff in different organizational units of the Hospital and the study is limited to documents availability.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Concept Of Human Resource motivation and satisfaction

Motivation energizes, directs, and sustains human behavior. It indicates the intention of achieving a goal, resulting in purposive behavior. It is important to reach futuristic



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

organizational goals (Kraye, K.J., & Westbrook, L. 1986). In human resource management, the term motivation refers to a person's desire to do the best possible job or to exert the maximum effort to perform assigned tasks (Burgoon, J.K. Buller, D.B. and Woodall, W.G. 1996). Satisfaction has been outlined as pleasant feeling resulting from the appraisal of one's job; and sensitive reaction to one's job; and an viewpoint towards one's job. Motivators contribute to job satisfaction and embody action, recognition, the work itself, responsibility, advancement, and growth (Fisher D. (2000). Organizational success depends heavily on workers motivation, and managers must understand what motivates their employees and employee motivation and satisfaction leads to organizational success (Brief AP, Roberson L.1989).

In health sector, job motivation is much linked to quality of services and patient satisfaction (Liu Jun A, Qi Wang ZuXLu, 2010). Dissatisfied work force has a negative impact on performance of the facilities. Moreover, it is a pushing subject for migration of health experts, from rural areas to the cities and out of the country (Pascal Z, et al. 2005). It is therefore an important effort of human resources management in the health sector to strengthen the motivation of health workers (Mathauer I, Imhoff I, 2006). Researchers have revealed that dissatisfied workers, if remained within the organization, might involve in harmful activities like wrong act, poor service, destructive rumors and sabotage of equipment. Employees' income dissatisfaction gives rise to high level of turnover intention, which ultimately leads to actual workers turnover (Samad S, 2006). Despite the fact that, human power is the backbone for the provision of quality health care and professional job satisfaction earns high dividends. Job motivation and satisfaction of medical experts in developing countries usually and in African nation particularly is incredibly low. A study conducted in Jimma University specialized hospital, southwest Ethiopia, in 2009 among 127 health workers indicated that only 41.4 % were motivated and satisfied with their job (Yami A, Hamza L et al, 2011).



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

These work values encompass such dimensions as professionalism, compensation and benefits expectations as well as autonomy (Seren and Baykal, 2007; Midttun, 2007). Physicians working in the private sector and physicians combining private and public work spend relatively more time on patient assignments than their public counterpart's do, while public physicians allocate more time to administrative and research/educational tasks. In addition, the context of service quality, research has shown that patients also perceive differences between public versus private sectors hospital service quality across various quality dimensions such as compassion, tangible equipment, facilities, hours of operation, reliability, administrative responsiveness and assurance (Chowdhury, 2008; Arasli et al., 2008; Kara et al., 2005; Pakdil and Harwood, 2005).

2.2 Improving Motivation and Job Satisfaction

There are variety of ways to improve motivation and job satisfaction. Improved job satisfaction and employee engagement can be achieved if organization, leaders or employers employ some steps.

However, below are five steps that can aid you to improve motivation and job satisfaction:

- i. Develop the skills and potential of your workforce.
- ii. Evaluate and measure job satisfaction.
- iii. Involve and increase employee engagement.
- iv. Provide a positive working environment.
- v. Reward and recognition.

2.3 Importance of Employee Motivation and Job Satisfaction

Job satisfaction is an individual's emotional response to his or her current job condition, while motivation is the driving force to pursue and satisfy one's needs. Therefore, staff or employees that are motivated and satisfied will have committed approach towards



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

organizational objective. However, organizations in turn will also have to show similar commitment towards employee objectives. Managers can help employees achieve overall job satisfaction, which, with the employee's internal motivation drive, increase performance on the job. In addition, it will be very vital and important to note that the role of HR is to continuously work towards alignment of aspirations of the employee with the goals of the organization

3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Research Design

This research work was designed to assess Job motivation and income satisfaction among governmental and private hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia. The Research design is used to guide the researcher on methods and procedures used in collecting and analyzing measures of the variables. The research design used in this study is the simple survey approach.

3.2 Population of the Study

The target populations included were all employees working in the private and governmental Hospitals (General and primary) in Ethiopia. Since governmental and private health facilities existed in Tigray region, employees of forty-two general and primary hospitals records and all the number of the private and public health facilities in the region (December 2018) were used. Because facilities are responsible for routine working activities in the health care delivery, Employees were considered appropriate as population of the study. Since most of them have had several years of working experiences with the human resource management they were realistic candidates to provide relevant information needed to answer the research question of this study.

All governmental and private general and primary hospital found in the Tigray region were included in the study and three hundred and seventy nine participants were selected randomly to fill structured questionnaires.



3.2.1 Inclusion criteria

- i. All staffs in the private and governmental hospitals who served atleast 6 months before the data collection time.

3.2.2 Exclusion criteria

- i. Health extension package worker, all health centers, clinics and private pharmacies were excluded from the study because it is huge in number but they have small staff and it is also not proportional with the public health facilities.

3.3 Sample Technique and Size

3.3.1 Sample Technique

For this research work, the simple random sampling (SRS) and Stratified Sampling technique was used; where all the units of analysis in the population that is, everybody in the organization has an equal chance of being chosen. The researcher partitioned the population into groups based on a factor that may influence the variable that is being measured. Using the stratified sampling the researcher partitioned the population into groups (strata), obtain a simple random sample from each group (stratum) and collect data on each sampling unit that was randomly sampled from each group (stratum).

However, two (2) sampling techniques, the simple random sampling (SRS) and Stratified Sampling technique were used because there are obviously times when one sampling method is preferred over the other.

3.3.2 Sample Size

All governmental and private Hospitals were assessed

3.4 Instruments of Data Collection



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

Data were collected using self-administer structured questionnaire. The study population was inviting participants to participate voluntarily by explaining the rationale of the study at the time of data collection. Trained data collectors were used to distribute questionnaires for the employees during their tea or lunch breaks and at the beginning or end of work hours. Written guidelines were given to the administrators of the questionnaire to ensure that each employee receives the same direction and information and the study was utilized both in qualitative and quantitative data collection methods. Primary data were obtained using questionnaires as well as interviews. Secondary data was sourced from Textbooks, journals, manuals, national guidelines etc.

3.5 Ethical Considerations

To carry out this research, ethical clearances were requested from the LIGS University and letter of support from Tigray regional health bureau. A letter was issued allowing carrying out the study. Once this is obtained the study was preceded. Permission was obtained from each private and public health facilities of administration office. Then permission from the participants was sought using the permission letter from the head of Tigray regional health bureau. All the participants were required to assent or sign a letter of information consent. Participants were also given freedom to withdraw their consent at any time if they are not comfortable. All data and personal information was kept confidential, as no identifying information was required in the questionnaire. Participants may choose not to answer any questions that they may find not comfortable. Returns were given for services and privacy and wishes of the participants is respected at all times.

3.6 Anticipated Limitations to the Study

The businesses being privately owned, employees tend to have limited zeal to participate in the research. Due to such an attitude, it may be cumbersome to locate



some employees and convince them to give extra time to provide some information for the study.

However, the researcher fixed as many appointments as he can in order to get the required information from these respondents.

4. DATA ANALYSIS

4.1 Introduction

The study tried to assess Job motivation and income satisfaction among governmental and private hospitals in Tigray region, Ethiopia. For this study, 379 questionnaires were distributed to the employees currently working in 42 public and private general and primary hospitals in the region. All distributed questionnaires were filled up and returned with response rate of 100%.

Data was cleaned, edited, coded after it was entered into Epi Info version 3.4.3 and exported to SPSS version 25. Using SPSS version 25, descriptive statistics were used to determine indices. Factor analysis was done to identify factors that explained most of the variance observed in the population with regard to each scale.

The analysis of variance to comparing of responses from public and private hospital respondents and multiple linear regressions for identifying determinants of employee satisfaction and management at public and private hospitals, were done. A significance level of 0.05 was used in all cases.

Table: 1 Job motivation and income satisfaction frequency

Variables	S. Agree	Perc ent	Agree	Perce nt	Not Sur e	Perc ent	S. Disagree	Perc ent	Disagr ee	Perce nt	Total (%)
The training programs are	31	8.2	143	37.7	64	16.9	59	15.6	82	21.6	100



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

designed to fill performance gaps											
applicants qualifications are given the highest priority	38	10.0	123	32.5	98	25.9	33	8.7	87	23.0	100
Employees are encouraged to participate in problem solving matters	31	8.2	146	38.5	58	15.3	53	14.0	91	24.0	100
Employees feel happy by the results of appraising their Performance	29	7.7	93	24.5	81	21.4	77	20.3	99	26.1	100
My Salary in this institution is enough for me	24	6.3	81	21.4	21	5.5	131	34.6	122	32.2	100
My organization gives competent	17	4.5	63	16.6	65	17.2	121	31.9	113	29.8	100



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

our organizational, salary and other benefits are comparable to the market	15	4.0	46	12.1	51	13.5	164	43.3	103	27.2	100
compensation for all employees is directly linked to his/her performance	23	6.1	88	23.2	55	14.5	109	28.8	109	28.8	100

Source: Own computation (2019).

- i. The training programs are designed to fill performance gaps:
In the findings in table1, the training programs designed to fill performance gaps revealed that 174 (45.9%) which is around half of the employees respondents agree and 64(16.9%) respondents are not sure the training programs are designed to fill performance gaps, whereas 141(37.2%) respondents disagree that the organization training programs are designed to fill performance gaps.
- ii. Applicant’s qualifications are given the highest priority:
As shown in table 4, majority of the employees 38 (10.0%) and 123(32.5%) respondents strongly agreed with the recruitment and selection through



the applicants qualification that gives highest priority while 98(25.9%) are not sure, whereas 33(8.7%) and 87(23%) respondent strongly disagree the recruitment and selection give highest priority to qualification.

iii. Employees are encouraged to participate in problem solving matters:

The encouragement of problem solving matters participation of employees in the organization responses are as shown in table 4; Thus, 31(8.2%) and 146(38.5%) almost majority of the respondents replied strongly agree the organizations encourage the employees in problem solving matters and 58 (15.3%) respondents responded not sure, whereas 53(14%) and 91 (24%) respondents responded strongly disagree.

iv. Employees feel happy by the results of appraising their Performance:

As indicated above in table 1, Employees feel happy by the results of appraising of their Performance. However, 12 (32.2%) of them showed their agreement that employees feel happy by the result of appraising of their performance and while 81 (21.45) employees responded not sure. However, 176(46.4%) employees disagree that the Employees do not feel happy with the results of appraising their Performance and the remaining respondents indicated that employees did not feel happy by appraising their performance.

v. Salary in this institution is enough for me:

The frequency analysis revealed that 105 (27.7%) employees identified that salary in the institution is agreed to be enough, 21(5.5%) respondent were not sure, whereas, 253(66.8) employees disagree on the salary of the institution is not enough by showing their disagreement.

vi. The organization gives competence or skill based workers payment increment:

As indicated above in table 1, the organization gives competence or skill based workers payment increment. However, 80(21.1%) of them agreed



while 65 (17.2%) employees responded not sure and 234(57.8%) employees disagree that the organization gives competence or skill based workers payment increment.

This implies that employees are not given any top up allowance or competence skills based on payment in the process of work and this largely influences the performance of employees in the long run. The availability of such top up allowances allows staff members in their organizations to work effectively which significantly contributes to the performance of the overall performance of the enterprise in the long run.

- vii. Our organizations salary and other benefits are comparable to the market:

As indicated In table1, Frequency analysis was conducted to find the response. The finding revealed that 61(16.1%) the few employees agreed to respond that organization, salary and other benefits are comparable to the market, 51(13.5%) respondents were not sure, while the majority 267(70.5%) employees showed their disagreement.

- viii. Compensation for all employees is directly linked to his/her performance:

Table1, clearly identified the responses of employees that is,111(29.3%) employees proved that the Compensation for all employees is directly linked to his/her performance, 55 (14.5%) employees said they are not sure, whereas, 218(57.6%) more than half of the respondent disagree with the idea.

4.2 Cross tabulation With Chi-Square Data Analysis to measure Relationship between the Facility type and Variables.

An important consideration when cross tabulating the findings of the study is verifying to see whether the represented in the cross-tab is true or false.

Table : 2 Job motivation and income satisfaction Cross tabulation



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

Variables cross tabulation	Facility Type	Agree	Disagree	Not sure	Strongly agree	Strongly Disagree	Total	Pearson chi-square value	Degree of freedom	P-Value	90%Confidence interval		Interpretation
											Lower Bound	Upper Bound	
Facility Type (Governmental and Private) Verses The training programs are designed to fill performance gaps	Governmental	119	74	57	24	57	331	7.55	4	.110	.110	.104	There is no evidence of a relationship between the facility type and The training programs are designed to fill performance gaps
	Private	24	10	7	5	2	48						
Facility Type Governmental and Private Verses applicants qualifications given the highest priority	Governmental	105	78	90	26	32	331	11.16	4	.025	.026	.023	There is no evidence of a relationship between the facility type and applicants qualifications given the highest priority
	Private	17	10	10	10	1	48						
Facility Type Governmental and Private Verses Employees are encouraged to participate in problem solving matters	Governmental	117	86	54	21	53	331	23.29	4	.000	.00	.00	There is very strong evidence of relationship between the facility type and Employees are encouraged to participate in problem solving matters
	Private	27	5	6	9	1	48						
Facility Type Governmental And Private Verses Employees feel happy by the results of appraising their Performance	Governmental	74	92	71	22	72	331		4	.042	.041	.037	There is slightly evidence of a relationship between the facility type and Employees feel happy by the results of appraising their Performance
	Private	17	11	8	7	5	48	9.91					
Facility Type Governmental	Governmental	51	97	54	11	118	331	23.41	4	.00	.000	.000	There is very strong evidence of a
	Private	15.4	29.3	16.3	3.3%	35.6%	100%			0			



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

and Private Verses	Count and Percent	%	%	%										relationship between the facility type and
My organization gives competence or skill based pay increment	Private Count and Percent	12 25.0 %	15 31.3 %	12 25.0 %	6 12.5%	3 6.3%	48 100%							My organization gives competence or skill based pay increment
Facility Type Governmental And Private Verses	Governmental Count and Percent	33 10.0 %	89 26.9 %	40 12.1 %	11 3.3%	158 47.7%	331 100%	30.69	4	.00 0	.000	.000	.000	There is very strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and
Our organization, salary and other benefits are comparable to the market	Private Count and Percent	16 33.3 %	13 27.1 %	9 18.8 %	3 6.3%	7 14.6%	48 100%							our organization, salary and other benefits are comparable to the market
Facility Type Governmental And Private Verses	Governmental Count and Percent	67 20.2 %	91 27.5 %	49 14.8 %	18 5.4%	106 32.0%	331 100%	16.92	4	.00 2	.002	.001	.001	There is very strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and
Compensation for all employees is directly linked to his/her performance	Private Count and Percent	19 39.6 %	12 25% %	8 16.7 5%	5 10.4 %	4 8.3%	48 100%							compensation for all employees is directly linked to his/her performance
Facility Type Governmental and Private Verses	Governmental Count and Percent	63 19.0 %	109 32.9 %	15 4.5 %	17 5.1%	127 38.4%	331 100%	20.99	4	.00 0	.001	.000	.000	There is very strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and
My Salary in this institution is enough for me	Private Count and Percent	15 31.3 %	16 33.3 %	6 12.5 %	6 12.5 %	5 10.4%	48 100%							My Salary in this institution is enough for me

Source : Own computation (2019)

4.3 Discussion of Findings

4.3.1 Discussion On Variables Associated With Facility Type



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

There was difference in the training programs that are designed to fill performance gaps that favors employee's career future between governmental and private Hospitals.

The finding in table 2. revealed that Training needs to be identified, realistic, useful and is based on the service strategy of organization that is statically associated ($P= 0.012$ (95% confidence interval)). There is very strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and Training needs identified based on the service strategy. This shows that there is difference identified during training needs based on the service strategy between governmental and private Hospitals.

During evaluation the applicants qualifications is given highest priority because in the facility types, there is very strong evidence of relationship between the facility types and Recruitment and Selection in the organization giving highest priority on the applicants qualification, ($P=0.025$: 95% confidence interval). Which means there is a difference of recruitment and selection activities in governmental and private health institutions.

The study conducted about Health Care Workforce Priority in America declared that private health care institution gave more priority for qualification than experience. This research finding also identified that there is a significant difference on giving priority for qualification between public and private health facilities, Aiken (L. H., & Salmon, M. E. (1994).

The result in table 2. showed that the Organization encourage performance in teams on different tasks statically associated ($P= 0.019$ (95% confidence interval)). There is also strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and encourage performance in teams on different tasks. This shows that there is the difference during performance encouragement between public and private health facilities.

There was no difference in organization carrying out performance evaluation of each individual employee and organization that has a shared understanding or way of how to achieve what favors employee's career future between public and private health facilities.



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

The judgment in table 2 revealed that employees feel happy by the results of appraising which was statically associated as ($P= 0.042$ (95% confidence interval)). There is strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and employees feeling happy by the results of appraising. This shows that there is the difference during happiness by the results of appraising between public and private health facilities.

The finding in table 2. revealed that the organization positive performance appraisal leads to rewards statically associated ($P= 0.013$ (95% confidence interval)). There is strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and positive performance appraisal which leads to rewards. This shows that there is difference during positive performance appraisal which leads to reward between public and private health facilities.

Variables asked the organization salary and other benefits comparable to the market were statically associated with ($P=0 .000$ (95% confidence interval)). There is very strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and the salary and benefits are comparable to the market. This shows that there is difference during the salary and benefits are comparable to the market.

The Variable asked whether facilities compensation for all employees directly linked to his/her performance was statically associated to ($P= 0. 002$ (95% confidence interval)). There is very strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and compensation for all employees which is directly linked to his/her performance. This shows that there is difference during compensation for all employees which is directly linked to the performance.

When the current salary structure improving service delivery and Salary in this institution is enough for the employees is assessed, there is also both very strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type ($P=0.000$: 95% confidence interval). That means there is difference during the assessment of salary structure improving service delivery and Salary in this institution is enough for the employees between public and private health facilities.



The finding in table 2. revealed that organization gives competence or skill based pay increment, cash bonus based on the surplus made per and usually organizes small non-cash awards to staff statically associated all with the ($P= 0.000$ - 95% confidence interval). There is strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and organization which gives competence or skill based pay increment. Oorganization gives cash bonus based on the surplus made per and the organization usually organizes small non-cash awards to staff statically associated. This shows that there is difference during organization competence or skill based pay increment which gives cash bonus based made per and usually organizes small non-cash awards to staff between public and private health facilities.

The Variable asked whether organization Job performance is an important factor in determining the incentive compensation of employees statically associated to ($P= 0.012$ - 95% confidence interval). There is strong evidence of a relationship between the facility type and organization Job performance as an important factor in determining the incentive compensation of employees. This shows that there is difference during Job performance.

The study showed that organization salary and other benefits are comparable to the market and compensation for all employees which is directly linked to his/her performance was statically associated ($P= 0.00$ and 0.002 - 95% confidence interval). There is strong evidence of relationship between the facility type and salary; benefits are comparable to the market, and compensation for all employees as directly linked to performance was statically associated. This shows that there is difference during salary and benefits that are comparable to the market and compensation for all employees is directly linked to performance between public and private health facilities

5. CONCLUSION

5.1 Conclusion



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

This study is conducted for the assessment of the Job motivation and income satisfaction among governmental and private hospitals. It encompasses recruitment and selection, training and development, performance appraisal, rewarding and compensation of human resource practice.

The finding of this research showed that employee recruitment and selection and application of employee's qualifications during recruitment were different between governmental and private hospitals. In addition, the differences were identified by accepting suggestions for organization improvement and participation in problem solving once employees were recruited. In Training and Development, the activities that show difference from the governmental and private hospitals are provision of the training programs which are designed to fill the performance gaps.

When performance appraisal section was also assessed; activities like employees feel happy due to results of appraising Performance. Compensation of all employees is directly linked to their performance and were different between governmental and private hospitals. The other section also seen was compensation/rewards management and in this section, there was the difference in activities like paying of reasonable salary and compensation between the governmental and private hospitals.

When we saw the salary satisfaction, employees in private facilities were highly satisfied than the governmental health facility and similarly employees in private health facilities were satisfied and motivated more on their employment.

5.2 Recommendation

Overall, this research showed that there is difference in Job motivation and income satisfaction activities like recruitment and selection, training and development, performance appraisal and rewarding and compensations. It also recommended that:

- i. There should be an equilibrium human resource combination and professional's competency between governmental and private health facilities.



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

- ii. Salaries and other compensation payments should be adjusted as per market value and other basic necessary needs.
- iii. Further research should be conducted to strengthen the findings of this research

REFERENCE

1. .Arasli, H., Haktan Ekiz, E., & Turan Katircioglu, S. (2008). Gearing service quality into public and private hospitals in small islands: empirical evidence from Cyprus. *International journal of health care quality assurance*, 21(1), 8-23.
2. Amin, S., Das, J., & Goldstein, M. (Eds.). (2007). *Are you being served? New tools for measuring service delivery*. The World Bank.
3. Anand, S., & Bärnighausen, T. (2004). Human resources and health outcomes: cross-country econometric study. *The Lancet*, 364(9445), 1603-1609.
4. Babakus, E., Yavas, U., Karatepe, O. M., & Avci, T. (2003). The effect of management commitment to service quality on employees' affective and performance outcomes. *Journal of the Academy of marketing Science*, 31(3), 272-286.
5. Basu, S., Andrews, J., Kishore, S., Panjabi, R., & Stuckler, D. (2012). Comparative performance of private and public healthcare systems in low-and middle-income countries: a systematic review. *PLoS medicine*, 9(6), e1001244.
6. Brief AP, Roberson L.(1989). Job attitude organization: an exploratory study. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology* 19: 71727.
7. Burgoon, J.K. Buller, D.B. and Woodall, W.G. (1996) *Nonverbal Communication*, New York: McGraw-Hill
8. Dibaba, S. (2013). *Assessment of the human resource management practices in Ethiopian Public Health Association (EPHA)* (Doctoral dissertation, St. Mary's University).
9. Dubois, C. A., & Mckee, M. (2006). Cross-national comparisons of human resources for health–what can we learn?. *Health Economics, Policy and Law*, 1(1), 59-78.
10. Eggleston, K., Ling, L., Qingyue, M., Lindelow, M., & Wagstaff, A. (2008). Health service delivery in China: a literature review. *Health economics*, 17(2), 149-165.



11. Farooq, M., & Khan, M. A. (2011). Impact of training and feedback on employee performance. *Far east journal of psychology and business*, 5(1), 23-33.
12. Federal Ministry of Health of Ethiopia (2008). *Health and Health Related Indicators of Ethiopia*. Addis Ababa: Ministry Of Health;.
13. Fisher D. (2000). Mood and emotions while working: missing pieces of job satisfaction? *Journal of Organizational Behavior* 21, 185-202
14. Griffiths, P., Maben, J., & Murrells, T. (2011). Organisational quality, nurse staffing and the quality of chronic disease management in primary care: observational study using routinely collected data. *International journal of nursing studies*, 48(10), 1199-1210.
15. Hayes, D. K., & Ninemeier, J. D. (2009). *Human resources management in the hospitality industry*. John Wiley & Sons.
16. Hongoro, C., & McPake, B. (2004). How to bridge the gap in human resources for health. *The Lancet*, 364(9443), 1451-1456.
17. Krayer, K.J., & Westbrook, L. (1986). The relationship between communication load and job satisfaction. *World Communication*, 15, 85-99
18. Liu Jun A, Qi Wang ZuXLu.(2010). Job satisfaction and its modeling among township health center employees: a quantitative study in poor rural China. *BMC Health Serv Res*. 10:115. doi:10.1186/1472-6963-10-115.
19. Martinez, J., & Martineau, T. (1998). Rethinking human resources: an agenda for the millennium. *Health policy and Planning*, 13(4), 345-358.
20. Mathauer I, Imhoff I.(2006). Health worker motivation in Africa: the role of nonfinancial incentives and human resource management tools. *BMC Human Resour Health*. 4(24). doi:10.1186/1478-4491-4-24.
21. Midttun, L. (2007). Private or public? An empirical analysis of the importance of work values for work sector choice among Norwegian medical specialists. *Social Science & Medicine*, 64(6), 1265-1277.
22. Pakdil, F., & Harwood, T. N. (2005). Factors that influence efficiency in performing ENT cases: a qualitative and quantitative analysis. *Journal of medical systems*, 29(3), 285-301.
23. Pascal Z, et al.(2005).Nurse retention and recruitment: developing a motivated workforce. *Glob Nurs Rev Initiat*. 19(4):58–84.



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

24. Samad S.(2006).The contribution of demographic variables: job characteristics and job satisfaction on turnover. *Intent J Int Manage Stud.* 1(1):1–12.
25. Seren, S. And Baykal, U.,(2007). Relationships between Change and Organizational Culture in Hospitals. *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, 39(2), Pp.191-197.
26. Stavrou, E. T., Charalambous, C., & Spiliotis, S. (2007). Human resource management and performance: A neural network analysis. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 181(1), 453-467.
27. Swaminathan, J., & Gowrishankar, U. (2010). Employee engagement practices in private hospitals: a cross sectional study in mayiladuthurai.
28. Yami A, Hamza L et al.(2011). Job satisfaction and its determinants among health workers in Jimma University specialized hospital, southwest Ethiopia. *Ethiop J Health Sci.*;21(special issue):19–27.

Doctoral Supervisor's feedback (approximately 100 words):



Leadership
Innovation
Growth
Success

The supervisor critically reviewed the thesis and the purpose was clearly stated. The abstract is as its present form and the introduction was well written. The methodology section is also well described in terms of background including mode of action associated with each endpoint. In the Data analysis section, the second table (Table 2) was unrefined so the author should have made it like the first table (Table 1). Data analysis has few grammatical errors but I think it is understandable. Overall the research will add knowledge and it can be accepted.